

MSCs, but not mesenchymal stem cells

Phuc Van Pham^{1,2} 

ABSTRACT

Mesenchymal stem cells (MSCs) are prevalent within the human body and can be detected and isolated from nearly all tissues. The acronym MSCs is widely recognized as referring to adult stem cells with multipotent capabilities. Despite over 40 years of applications in research and clinical settings, the definition of MSCs as mesenchymal stem cells has faced scrutiny concerning their "stemness" and the underlying mechanisms of their therapeutic effects. In 2010, Dr. Arnold I. Caplan suggested redefining MSCs as "medicinal signaling cells" rather than mesenchymal stem cells. In this commentary, I concur with Dr. Caplan's view but further propose that MSCs be regarded as "master signaling cells." The primary therapeutic mechanism of MSCs is their signaling function. They respond to signals from immune cells to become activated and, in turn, act as signaling regulators for other cells. As master signaling cells, MSCs are multipotent stem cells present in almost all tissues, playing vital roles in regulating tissue homeostasis and facilitating tissue regeneration.

Key words: medicinal signaling cell, master signaling cell, mesenchymal stem cell, multipotent stem cell, stromal stem cell

The concept of mesenchymal stem cells (MSCs) is well-established in the stem cell research and application community, with "MSCs" commonly used as an abbreviation. However, there is ongoing debate regarding whether this term refers to mesenchymal stem cells, mesenchymal stromal cells, or multipotent stem cells. These terms all describe a type of cell first identified in the 1950s. The initial report of bone formation through bone marrow transplantation was documented in 1956¹. Subsequent research by Friedenstein *et al.* (1966) identified osteogenesis from bone marrow during transplantation procedures². Notably, in 1980, it was demonstrated that a suspension of marrow cells or fibroblasts derived from bone marrow could differentiate into bone and cartilage *in vivo*³. The concept of MSCs was further developed in a 1991 paper by Dr. Arnold Caplan, who described the isolation of a specific type of stem cell found in bone marrow⁴.

In 1995, Drs. Wakitani and Saito, conducting research in Dr. Caplan's laboratory, reported the inducible differentiation of these cells into muscle cells and adipocytes^{5,6}. Following this, Dr. Johnstone (1998) demonstrated that mesenchymal stem cells (MSCs) could differentiate into chondrocytes⁷. Additionally, Dr. Pittenger and colleagues (1999) provided evidence for the differentiation of MSCs into osteocytes, chondrocytes, and adipocytes⁸. In subsequent years, cells analogous to bone marrow-derived

MSCs were successfully identified and isolated from diverse tissues such as adipose tissue⁹, umbilical cord blood^{10,11}, umbilical cord¹², placenta¹³, dental pulp¹⁴, skin¹⁵, and hair follicles¹⁶. In 2006, the International Society for Cellular Therapy (ISCT) established minimal criteria for defining MSCs, which included (1) adherence to plastic culture surfaces while exhibiting a fibroblast-like morphology, (2) the expression of surface markers CD105, CD73, and CD90, while lacking CD14, CD34, CD45, and HLA-DR, and (3) the capability to differentiate *in vitro* into osteoblasts, chondroblasts, and adipocytes¹⁷. Generally, these criteria reflect the two pivotal characteristics of stem cells: their ability to self-renew and differentiate. However, this standard has not yet definitively proven that the cells have the self-renewal capability, which remains one of the essential characteristics of stem cells.

Mesenchymal stem cells (MSCs) were initially employed for the treatment of bone and cartilage diseases¹⁸⁻²¹. Subsequently, the application of MSCs expanded to include a variety of conditions such as chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD)^{22,23}, graft-versus-host disease²⁴, Crohn's disease²⁵, spinal cord injury²⁶, heart failure²⁷, and frailty²⁸. Numerous studies have demonstrated the therapeutic efficacy of MSC transplantation, leading to the approval of specific treatments or drugs, such as Prochymal²⁹, Temcell HS³⁰, and Cartistem³¹. However, the

¹Stem Cell Institute, University of Science, Ho Chi Minh City, Viet Nam

²Viet Nam National University Ho Chi Minh City, Ho Chi Minh City, Viet Nam

Email: phucpham@sci.edu.vn

History

- Received: Aug 04, 2024
- Accepted: Sept 05, 2024
- Published Online: Sept 30, 2024

DOI : 10.15419/bmrat.v11i9.924



Copyright

© Biomedpress. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International license.



Cite this article : Van Pham P. *MSCs, but not mesenchymal stem cells*. *Biomed. Res. Ther.* 2024; 11(9):6797-6800.

therapeutic mechanism of MSCs appears to be independent of their stemness or differentiation capabilities. As a result, many scientists attribute the therapeutic effects of MSCs to alternative processes, particularly the secretion of factors such as secretomes and exosomes³²⁻³⁴. The release of components like growth factors, cytokines, and exosomes is deemed crucial for their therapeutic impact, contrasting with hematopoietic stem cells, whose efficacy results from differentiation into blood cells. Some studies also suggest that cell-to-cell interactions involving surface proteins significantly contribute to the therapeutic effectiveness of MSCs³⁴⁻³⁶.

I have reviewed studies that provide evidence of mesenchymal stem cell (MSC) differentiation into cells with therapeutic potential, particularly non-mesenchymal cells such as lung cells, nerve cells, and beta cells; however, such investigations are exceedingly rare. Furthermore, in treating diseases associated with substantial tissue damage, such as bone defects and challenging regeneration scenarios, it appears more advantageous to utilize cell mixtures derived from bone marrow rather than bone marrow-derived MSCs³⁷. The issues concerning the definitions and mechanisms of MSCs in therapeutic applications have generated substantial debate and raised critical questions. The divergence in therapeutic mechanisms from the traditional understanding of stem cells has led to the proposal of an alternative term by the originator of the concept: "medicinal signaling cell" (MSC)³⁸. Subsequently, Douglas Sipp and colleagues advocated for clinics to refrain from using the term "mesenchymal stem cell" in marketing stem cell and regenerative medicine therapies³⁹. Despite these recommendations, the notion of MSCs as mesenchymal stem cells is deeply entrenched in the scientific community and remains widespread in scientific publications.

Drawing from research experience, I propose redefining mesenchymal stem cells as "**master signaling cells**" (MSCs). This conceptualization implies that master signaling cells are fundamental across all tissues, including the blood. They are crucial for signaling tissue regeneration following damage, as they receive activation signals from inflammatory factors released by immune cells and subsequently transmit signals to facilitate regeneration. While I do not expect an immediate shift to the term "**master signaling cell**" from "mesenchymal stem cell," nor a change in the nomenclature when these cells are isolated from tissues, I aspire for this terminology to foster a more precise and comprehensive understanding of the therapeutic mechanisms and actual roles of these cells,

ultimately helping to resolve continuous debates on their genuine therapeutic applications.

ABBREVIATIONS

None.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

None.

AUTHOR'S CONTRIBUTIONS

Not applicable.

FUNDING

None.

AVAILABILITY OF DATA AND MATERIALS

Not applicable.

ETHICS APPROVAL AND CONSENT TO PARTICIPATE

Not applicable.

CONSENT FOR PUBLICATION

Not applicable.

COMPETING INTERESTS

The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

REFERENCES

1. Danis A. Etude de l'ossification dans les greffes de moelle osseuse. 1956; Available from: <https://difusion.ulb.ac.be/vufind/Record/ULB-DIPOT:oai:dipot.ulb.ac.be:2013/215761/Details>.
2. Friedenstein A, Piatetzky-Shapiro I, Petrakova K. Osteogenesis in transplants of bone marrow cells. *Development* (Cambridge, England). 1966;16(3):381-90. PMID: 5336210. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1242/dev.16.3.381>.
3. Ashton BA, Allen TD, Howlett C, Eaglesom C, Hattori A, Owen M. Formation of bone and cartilage by marrow stromal cells in diffusion chambers in vivo. *Clinical Orthopaedics and Related Research*. 1980;(151):294-307. PMID: 7418319. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1097/00003086-198009000-00040>.
4. Caplan AI. Mesenchymal stem cells. *Journal of Orthopaedic Research*. 1991;9(5):641-50. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1002/jor.1100090504>.
5. Wakitani S, Saito T, Caplan AI. Myogenic cells derived from rat bone marrow mesenchymal stem cells exposed to 5-azacytidine. *Muscle & Nerve*. 1995;18(12):1417-26. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1002/mus.880181212>.
6. Saito T, Dennis JE, Lennon DP, Young RG, Caplan AI. Myogenic Expression of Mesenchymal Stem Cells within Myotubes of mdx Mice in Vitro and in Vivo. *Tissue Engineering*. 1995;1(4):327-43. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1089/ten.1995.1.327>.
7. Johnstone B, Hering TM, Caplan AI, Goldberg VM, Yoo JU. In vitro chondrogenesis of bone marrow-derived mesenchymal progenitor cells. *Experimental Cell Research*. 1998;238(1):265-72. PMID: 9457080. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1006/excr.1997.3858>.

8. Pittenger MF, Mackay AM, Beck SC, Jaiswal RK, Douglas R, Mosca JD. Multilineage potential of adult human mesenchymal stem cells. *Science*. 1999;284(5411):143–7. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.284.5411.143>.
9. Gimble JM, Guilak F. Adipose-derived adult stem cells: isolation, characterization, and differentiation potential. *Cytherapy*. 2003;5(5):362–9. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1080/14653240310003026>.
10. Bieback K, Kern S, Klüter H, Eichler H. Critical Parameters for the Isolation of Mesenchymal Stem Cells from Umbilical Cord Blood. *Stem Cells (Dayton, Ohio)*. 2004;22(4):625–34. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1634/stemcells.22-4-625>.
11. Lee OK, Kuo TK, Chen WM, Lee KD, Hsieh SL, Chen TH. Isolation of multipotent mesenchymal stem cells from umbilical cord blood. *Blood*. 2004;103(5):1669–75. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1182/blood-2003-05-1670>.
12. Mitchell KE, Weiss ML, Mitchell BM, Martin P, Davis D, Morales L. Matrix cells from Wharton's jelly form neurons and glia. *Stem Cells (Dayton, Ohio)*. 2003;21(1):50–60. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1634/stemcells.21-1-50>.
13. Li CD, Zhang WY, Li HL, Jiang XX, Zhang Y, Tang PH. Mesenchymal stem cells derived from human placenta suppress allogeneic umbilical cord blood lymphocyte proliferation. *Cell Research*. 2005;15(7):539–47. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1038/sj.cr.7290323>.
14. Galli R, Borello U, Gritti A, Minasi MG, Bjornson C, Coletta M. Skeletal myogenic potential of human and mouse neural stem cells. *Nature Neuroscience*. 2000;3(10):986–91. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1038/79924>.
15. Toma JG, Akhavan M, Fernandes KJ, Barnabé-Heider F, Sadikot A, Kaplan DR. Isolation of multipotent adult stem cells from the dermis of mammalian skin. *Nature Cell Biology*. 2001;3(9):778–84. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1038/ncb0901-778>.
16. Gentile P, Scioli MG, Bielli A, Orlandi A, Cervelli V. Stem cells from human hair follicles: first mechanical isolation for immediate autologous clinical use in androgenetic alopecia and hair loss. *Stem Cell Investigation*. 2017;4(7):58. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.21037/sci.2017.06.04>.
17. Dominici M, Blanc KL, Mueller I, Slaper-Cortenbach I, Marini FC, Krause DS. Minimal criteria for defining multipotent mesenchymal stromal cells. The International Society for Cellular Therapy position statement. *Cytherapy*. 2006;8(4):315–7. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1080/14653240600855905>.
18. Ohgushi H, Goldberg VM, Caplan AI. Repair of bone defects with marrow cells and porous ceramic: experiments in rats. *Acta Orthopaedica Scandinavica*. 1989;60(3):334–9. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.3109/17453678909149289>.
19. Wakitani S, Goto T, Pineda SJ, Young RG, Mansour JM, Caplan AI. Mesenchymal cell-based repair of large, full-thickness defects of articular cartilage. *The Journal of Bone and Joint Surgery American Volume*. 1994;76(4):579–92. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.2106/00004623-199404000-00013>.
20. Wakitani S, Imoto K, Yamamoto T, Saito M, Murata N, Yoneda M. Human autologous culture expanded bone marrow-mesenchymal cell transplantation for repair of cartilage defects in osteoarthritic knees. *Osteoarthritis and Cartilage*. 2002;10(3):199–206. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1053/joca.2001.0504>.
21. Gobbi A, Karnatzikos G, Scotti C, Mahajan V, Mazzucco L, Grigolo B. One-step cartilage repair with bone marrow aspirate concentrated cells and collagen matrix in full-thickness knee cartilage lesions: results at 2-year follow-up. *Cartilage*. 2011;2(3):286–99. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1177/1947603510392023>.
22. Liu X, Fang Q, Kim H. Preclinical Studies of Mesenchymal Stem Cell (MSC) Administration in Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease (COPD): A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. *PLoS One*. 2016;11(6):e0157099. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0157099>.
23. Broekman W, Khedoe P, Schepers K, Roelofs H, Stolk J, Hiemstra PS. Mesenchymal stromal cells: a novel therapy for the treatment of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease? *Thorax*. 2018;73(6):565–74. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1136/thoraxjnl-2017-210672>.
24. Blanc KL, Rasmusson I, Sundberg B, Götherström C, Hassan M, Uzunel M. Treatment of severe acute graft-versus-host disease with third party haploidentical mesenchymal stem cells. *Lancet*. 2004;363(9419):1439–41. Available from: [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(04\)16104-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(04)16104-7).
25. Ciccocioppo R, Bernardo ME, Sgarella A, Maccario R, Avanzini MA, Ubezio C. Autologous bone marrow-derived mesenchymal stromal cells in the treatment of fistulising Crohn's disease. *Gut*. 2011;60(6):788–98. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1136/gut.2010.214841>.
26. Chopp M, Zhang XH, Li Y, Wang L, Chen J, Lu D. Spinal cord injury in rat: treatment with bone marrow stromal cell transplantation. *Neuroreport*. 2000;11(13):3001–5. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1097/00001756-200009110-00035>.
27. Strauer BE, Brehm M, Zeus T, Köstering M, Hernandez A, Sorg RV. Repair of infarcted myocardium by autologous intracoronary mononuclear bone marrow cell transplantation in humans. *Circulation*. 2002;106(15):1913–8. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1161/01.CIR.0000034046.87607.1C>.
28. Tompkins BA, DiFede DL, Khan A, Landin AM, Schulman IH, Pujol MV. Allogeneic mesenchymal stem cells ameliorate aging frailty: a phase II randomized, double-blind, placebo-controlled clinical trial. *The Journals of Gerontology Series A, Biological Sciences and Medical Sciences*. 2017;72(11):1513–22. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1093/geron/glx137>.
29. Kurtzberg J, Abdel-Aziz H, Carpenter P, Chaudhury S, Horn B, Mahadeo K. A Phase 3, Single-Arm, Prospective Study of Remestemcel-L, Ex Vivo Culture-Expanded Adult Human Mesenchymal Stromal Cells for the Treatment of Pediatric Patients Who Failed to Respond to Steroid Treatment for Acute Graft-versus-Host Disease. *Biology of Blood and Marrow Transplantation*. 2020;26(5):845–54. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bbmt.2020.01.018>.
30. Konishi A, Sakushima K, Isobe S, Sato D. First Approval of Regenerative Medical Products under the PMD Act in Japan. *Cell Stem Cell*. 2016;18(4):434–5. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.stem.2016.03.011>.
31. Song JS, Hong KT, Kim NM, Jung JY, Park HS, Lee SH. Implantation of allogenic umbilical cord blood-derived mesenchymal stem cells improves knee osteoarthritis outcomes: two-year follow-up. *Regenerative Therapy*. 2020;14:32–9. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.reth.2019.10.003>.
32. Bagno LL, Salerno AG, Balkan W, Hare JM. Mechanism of Action of Mesenchymal Stem Cells (MSCs): impact of delivery method. *Expert Opinion on Biological Therapy*. 2022;22(4):449–63. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1080/14712598.2022.2016695>.
33. Zriek F, Battista JAD, Alaeddine N. Mesenchymal stromal cell secretome: immunomodulation, tissue repair and effects on neurodegenerative conditions. *Current Stem Cell Research & Therapy*. 2021;16(6):656–69. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.2174/1574888X16666210202145639>.
34. Song N, Scholtemeijer M, Shah K. Mesenchymal Stem Cell Immunomodulation: Mechanisms and Therapeutic Potential. *Trends in Pharmacological Sciences*. 2020;41(9):653–64. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tips.2020.06.009>.
35. Li N, Hua J. Interactions between mesenchymal stem cells and the immune system. *Cellular and Molecular Life Sciences*. 2017;74(13):2345–60. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00018-017-2473-5>.
36. Jiang W, Xu J. Immune modulation by mesenchymal stem cells. *Cell Proliferation*. 2020;53(1):e12712. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1111/cpr.12712>.
37. Du F, Wang Q, Ouyang L, Wu H, Yang Z, Fu X. Comparison of concentrated fresh mononuclear cells and cultured mesenchymal stem cells from bone marrow for bone regeneration. *Stem Cells Translational Medicine*. 2021;10(4):598–609. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1002/sctm.20-0234>.

38. Caplan AI. What's in a Name? Tissue Engineering Part A. 2010;16(8):2415-7. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1089/ten.tea.2010.0216>.
39. Sipp D, Robey PG, Turner L. Clear up this stem-cell mess. Nature. 2018;561:455-457. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1038/d41586-018-06756-9>.